

Municipality Slides Away from Liability... Again

13 juin 2018

In the recent decision of *Martin v. Barrie (City)*, 2018 ONCA 499, the Court of Appeal upheld the trial judge's decision confirming that the standard of care of an occupier pursuant to s. 3 of the Occupiers' Liability Act, 1990 is not one of perfection.

In February 2011, the plaintiff, Ms. Martin, attended the Winterfest and Festival of Ice (the "Festival") hosted annually by the City of Barrie (the "City"). While at the Festival, Ms. Martin and her two children decided to go down a snow slide which was specifically built for the Festival. The slide was designed for guests (children and adults) to go down feet first, on their bottoms. After watching her two children safely navigate the slide, it was Ms. Martin's turn. As she proceeded down the slide, Ms. Martin became worried that she would strike a safety fence located at the base of the slide, and so dug her heels into the slide to slow herself down. In doing so, she struck a hardened piece of ice protruding from the slide, resulting in injury.

At trial, the Court found that Ms. Martin digging her feet into the snow was likely the cause of the small ice chunk being dislodged. Further, the Court indicated that although there was some inherent risk known to the participants using the slide (described as "Canadian an activity as one can imagine"), there was a positive duty on the City to ensure that the operation of the slide was done in a reasonably safe way in the circumstance. Considering the City's evidence with respect to training its employees, as well as the City's maintenance and monitoring procedures, the Court held that the City had met the standard of care of an occupier. For a more detailed analysis of the trial judge's decision, please see the following case alert on our website.

Court of Appeal Decision

Three issues were raised on Appeal: (1) the trial Judge's characterization of the ice chunk as "small"; (2) the inference drawn from hearsay evidence that Ms. Marin heard a City employee say "I have to fill this again" immediately after she was injured; and (3) and the trial Judge's conclusion relating to the standard of care (detailed at para. 52 of the lower Courts decision and reproduced below):

I find that in the circumstances of this case, the standard of care was satisfied. The City of Barrie took adequate and reasonable steps to safeguard the guests using the snow slide at Winterfest. The context is important. The snow slide is a gradually sloped hill on which patrons slide down on their "bottoms." While specific measurements were not

tendered into evidence, the pictures tendered into evidence suggest that the hill is **neither steep nor tall**. **Guests are not using devices such as sleds or toboggans which would ordinarily be used to add speed to the descent**. The evidence suggests that guests come [to] a quick stop at the bottom of the slide.

The Court of Appeal quickly dismissed the first two grounds of appeal. With respect to the third ground for appeal, the Appellant argued that the City invited the public to ride the slide and that, in this context, the City failed to provide "a system of regular inspection and maintenance of the run-off area of the busy slide". In rejecting this **argument, the Court of Appeal held that "the trial judge made no error of any kind - let alone a palpable and overriding error"** with respect to the application of evidence of inspection and maintenance.

Further, the Court of Appeal adopted the trial Judge's comments that although a more rigorous inspection by the City may have revealed the hazard, such a finding would place too high of an onus on the City.

The Court of Appeal further confirmed that the standard of care placed on an occupier **under s. 3 the Occupiers' Liability Act, 1990** is one of reasonableness and not one of perfection.

Par

[Jonathan Thoburn, George R. Wray](#)

Services

[Plaidoirie en appel, Contestation de réclamations d'assurance](#)

BLG | Vos avocats au Canada

Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. (BLG) est le plus grand cabinet d'avocats canadien véritablement multiservices. À ce titre, il offre des conseils juridiques pratiques à des clients d'ici et d'ailleurs dans plus de domaines et de secteurs que tout autre cabinet canadien. Comptant plus de 725 avocats, agents de propriété intellectuelle et autres professionnels, BLG répond aux besoins juridiques d'entreprises et d'institutions au pays comme à l'étranger pour ce qui touche les fusions et acquisitions, les marchés financiers, les différends et le financement ou encore l'enregistrement de brevets et de marques de commerce.

blg.com

Bureaux BLG

Calgary

Centennial Place, East Tower
520 3rd Avenue S.W.
Calgary, AB, Canada
T2P 0R3

T 403.232.9500
F 403.266.1395

Ottawa

World Exchange Plaza
100 Queen Street
Ottawa, ON, Canada
K1P 1J9

T 613.237.5160
F 613.230.8842

Vancouver

1200 Waterfront Centre
200 Burrard Street
Vancouver, BC, Canada
V7X 1T2

T 604.687.5744
F 604.687.1415

Montréal

1000, rue De La Gauchetière Ouest
Suite 900
Montréal, QC, Canada
H3B 5H4

T 514.954.2555
F 514.879.9015

Toronto

Bay Adelaide Centre, East Tower
22 Adelaide Street West
Toronto, ON, Canada
M5H 4E3

T 416.367.6000
F 416.367.6749

Les présents renseignements sont de nature générale et ne sauraient constituer un avis juridique, ni un énoncé complet de la législation pertinente, ni un avis sur un quelconque sujet. Personne ne devrait agir ou s'abstenir d'agir sur la foi de ceux-ci sans procéder à un examen approfondi du droit après avoir soupesé les faits d'une situation précise. Nous vous recommandons de consulter votre conseiller juridique si vous avez des questions ou des préoccupations particulières. BLG ne garantit aucunement que la teneur de cette publication est exacte, à jour ou complète. Aucune partie de cette publication ne peut être reproduite sans l'autorisation écrite de Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. Si BLG vous a envoyé cette publication et que vous ne souhaitez plus la recevoir, vous pouvez demander à faire supprimer vos coordonnées de nos listes d'envoi en communiquant avec nous par courriel à desabonnement@blg.com ou en modifiant vos préférences d'abonnement dans blg.com/fr/about-us/subscribe. Si vous pensez avoir reçu le présent message par erreur, veuillez nous écrire à communications@blg.com. Pour consulter la politique de confidentialité de BLG relativement aux publications, rendez-vous sur blg.com/fr/ProtectionDesRenseignementsPersonnels.

© 2025 Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. Borden Ladner Gervais est une société à responsabilité limitée de l'Ontario.