

Court Does Not Require Defendant Insurer To Produce Its File From A Previous Related Action

07 octobre 2016

In the recent interlocutory decision, *Hall v. Peel Insurance Co.*, 2016 ONSC 5288, the Ontario Superior Court allowed an enlarged definition of litigation privilege and found that the defendant insurer was not required to produce its complete file nor its law firm's file with respect to a previous related action.

The plaintiff was a homeowner whose house was damaged by a fire. At the time, the plaintiff's home was occupied by a tenant, Mr. Doherty. The plaintiff was insured by Wawanesa and Mr. Doherty was insured through Peel Mutual Insurance Company ("Peel Mutual").

The plaintiff commenced an action against Mr. Doherty (the "first action"). Pursuant to the provisions of the policy, Peel Mutual retained a law firm to represent it. Ultimately, the law firm got off the record due to a lack of cooperation by Mr. Doherty. Mr. Doherty's defence was struck and the plaintiff obtained default judgment against him. Mr. Doherty subsequently filed for bankruptcy and the plaintiff was unable to collect. As a result, the plaintiff started a new action against Peel Mutual pursuant to section 132(1) of the **Insurance Act**, R.S.O. 1990, c. 18 (the "second action").

In the second action, the plaintiff brought a motion for production of the complete independent claims adjuster's file and Peel Mutual's complete file pertaining to the first action, which Peel Mutual had claimed litigation privilege over. In addition, the plaintiff sought production of the law firm's file relating to the first action, subject to solicitor-client privilege. All documents sought by the plaintiff were listed in Schedule "B" of Peel Mutual's Affidavit of Documents.

As of the motion date, Peel Mutual had already produced the complete independent adjuster's file. The remaining issues to be determined were the production of Peel Mutual's complete file and the production of the law firm's file.

When considering the issue of whether Peel Mutual's complete file and the law firm's file related to the first action should be produced, the Court addressed both solicitor-client privilege and litigation privilege and the duration of each. Specifically, quoting the 2006

Supreme Court decision in Blank v. Canada (Minister of Justice), 2006 S.C.J. 39, the Court noted that litigation privilege (unlike solicitor-client privilege) is of temporary duration and "expires with the litigation of which it was born" (Blank, para. 8).

However, this is not the case when matters are related. As stated by the Supreme Court of Canada in Blank:

[34] [Litigation privilege] cannot be said to have been "terminated" in any meaningful sense of that term, where litigants or related parties remain locked in what is essentially the same legal combat.

[39] At a minimum, it seems to me that this enlarged definition of "litigation" includes separate proceedings that involve the same or related parties and arises from the same or a related cause of action (or "judicial source"). Proceedings that raise issues common to the initial action and share its essential purpose would in my view qualify as well.

The Court found that the documents being requested from the law firm's file, namely emails from the firm to Peel Mutual, notes by lawyers and internal memos, were all covered by solicitor-client privilege and therefore ought not to be produced.

With respect to Peel Mutual's complete file, the Court found that an enlarged definition of "litigation privilege" was warranted, given that it had been originally prepared in connection with the first action, which had the same or related parties as the second action and issues in common to both actions. As a result, Peel Mutual was not required to produce its complete file with respect to the first action, which included Peel Mutual's claims notes.

This decision is a helpful reminder that litigation privilege does not necessarily end when an action has been concluded, but that it can carry over into subsequent actions with related parties and/or where the same issues are in dispute.

Par

[Rebecca Bush](#)

Services

[Contestation de réclamations d'assurance](#)

BLG | Vos avocats au Canada

Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. (BLG) est le plus grand cabinet d'avocats canadien véritablement multiservices. À ce titre, il offre des conseils juridiques pratiques à des clients d'ici et d'ailleurs dans plus de domaines et de secteurs que tout autre cabinet canadien. Comptant plus de 725 avocats, agents de propriété intellectuelle et autres professionnels, BLG répond aux besoins juridiques d'entreprises et d'institutions au pays comme à l'étranger pour ce qui touche les fusions et acquisitions, les marchés financiers, les différends et le financement ou encore l'enregistrement de brevets et de marques de commerce.

blg.com

Bureaux BLG

Calgary

Centennial Place, East Tower
520 3rd Avenue S.W.
Calgary, AB, Canada
T2P 0R3

T 403.232.9500
F 403.266.1395

Ottawa

World Exchange Plaza
100 Queen Street
Ottawa, ON, Canada
K1P 1J9

T 613.237.5160
F 613.230.8842

Vancouver

1200 Waterfront Centre
200 Burrard Street
Vancouver, BC, Canada
V7X 1T2

T 604.687.5744
F 604.687.1415

Montréal

1000, rue De La Gauchetière Ouest
Suite 900
Montréal, QC, Canada
H3B 5H4

T 514.954.2555
F 514.879.9015

Toronto

Bay Adelaide Centre, East Tower
22 Adelaide Street West
Toronto, ON, Canada
M5H 4E3

T 416.367.6000
F 416.367.6749

Les présents renseignements sont de nature générale et ne sauraient constituer un avis juridique, ni un énoncé complet de la législation pertinente, ni un avis sur un quelconque sujet. Personne ne devrait agir ou s'abstenir d'agir sur la foi de ceux-ci sans procéder à un examen approfondi du droit après avoir soupesé les faits d'une situation précise. Nous vous recommandons de consulter votre conseiller juridique si vous avez des questions ou des préoccupations particulières. BLG ne garantit aucunement que la teneur de cette publication est exacte, à jour ou complète. Aucune partie de cette publication ne peut être reproduite sans l'autorisation écrite de Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. Si BLG vous a envoyé cette publication et que vous ne souhaitez plus la recevoir, vous pouvez demander à faire supprimer vos coordonnées de nos listes d'envoi en communiquant avec nous par courriel à desabonnement@blg.com ou en modifiant vos préférences d'abonnement dans blg.com/fr/about-us/subscribe. Si vous pensez avoir reçu le présent message par erreur, veuillez nous écrire à communications@blg.com. Pour consulter la politique de confidentialité de BLG relativement aux publications, rendez-vous sur blg.com/fr/ProtectionDesRenseignementsPersonnels.

© 2025 Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. Borden Ladner Gervais est une société à responsabilité limitée de l'Ontario.