

Admissibility Of Expert Evidence: Songhees Nation V. British Columbia, 2017 BCSC 387 (Bracken J.), 8 March 2017

20 mars 2017

[Download the entire Aboriginal Legal Issues e-Newsletter – March 20, 2017](#)

The Supreme Court of British Columbia made an order relating to the admissibility of expert evidence in the underlying Douglas Treaty action.

The underlying actions involves separate claims by the Songhees Nation and the Esquimalt Nation relating to the lands near Cadboro Bay in Victoria. The plaintiffs allege that the Crown breached the terms of a treaty signed in 1850, and that the Crown failed to fulfil a term of the treaty allowing their ancestors to retain their village sites and enclosed fields. The trial of these actions has been adjourned on several occasions. Most recently, the trial date was vacated due to the Esquimalt Nation appealing an order of the case management judge about its ability to pursue an Aboriginal title claim.

In February 2016, the Court heard an application about the admissibility of new reports by Dr. John Lutz, a history professor at the University of Victoria, tendered by the Songhees Nation. The court's decision had been delayed due to the applications by the Esquimalt Nation to amend their pleadings, and a subsequent appeal, but there was a request by the Songhees for a decision to be issued at this time.

The additional material in the Lutz reports mostly relates to new documents found by Dr. Lutz through his research, and concern an alleged "pattern of behaviour" by the colonial government in failing to set aside lands for Aboriginal groups. British Columbia did not object to the new materials being admitted into evidence, but wanted adequate time to file a response report.

Bracken J. reviewed the delays that have occurred in this case. There had been an earlier decision about the exchange of expert reports in August 2012: 2012 BCSC 1269 (summarized in our e-newsletter of 4 September 2012). A more recent decision in April 2014 set strict deadlines for the exchange of expert reports in the spring of 2014. An application by the Songhees Nation in January 2015 to introduce further evidence from Dr. Lutz was rejected due to these earlier timelines.

The Court agreed that there would be no prejudice to the defendants that could not be compensated by costs. Bracken J. ordered that the Songhees Nation serve their additional material by 30 April 2017, and that response reports be filed no later than 45 days before the commencement of the trial.

<https://courts.gov.bc.ca/jdb-txt/sc/17/03/2017BCSC0387.htm>

Par

[Scott Kerwin](#)

Services

[Droit autochtone](#)

BLG | Vos avocats au Canada

Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. (BLG) est le plus grand cabinet d'avocats canadien véritablement multiservices. À ce titre, il offre des conseils juridiques pratiques à des clients d'ici et d'ailleurs dans plus de domaines et de secteurs que tout autre cabinet canadien. Comptant plus de 800 avocats, agents de propriété intellectuelle et autres professionnels, BLG répond aux besoins juridiques d'entreprises et d'institutions au pays comme à l'étranger pour ce qui touche les fusions et acquisitions, les marchés financiers, les différends et le financement ou encore l'enregistrement de brevets et de marques de commerce.

blg.com

Bureaux BLG

Calgary

Centennial Place, East Tower
520 3rd Avenue S.W.
Calgary, AB, Canada
T2P 0R3

T 403.232.9500
F 403.266.1395

Ottawa

World Exchange Plaza
100 Queen Street
Ottawa, ON, Canada
K1P 1J9

T 613.237.5160
F 613.230.8842

Vancouver

1200 Waterfront Centre
200 Burrard Street
Vancouver, BC, Canada
V7X 1T2

T 604.687.5744
F 604.687.1415

Montréal

1000, rue De La Gauchetière Ouest
Suite 900
Montréal, QC, Canada
H3B 5H4

T 514.954.2555
F 514.879.9015

Toronto

Bay Adelaide Centre, East Tower
22 Adelaide Street West
Toronto, ON, Canada
M5H 4E3

T 416.367.6000
F 416.367.6749

Les présents renseignements sont de nature générale et ne sauraient constituer un avis juridique, ni un énoncé complet de la législation pertinente, ni un avis sur un quelconque sujet. Personne ne devrait agir ou s'abstenir d'agir sur la foi de ceux-ci sans procéder à un examen approfondi du droit après avoir soupesé les faits d'une situation précise. Nous vous recommandons de consulter votre conseiller juridique si vous avez des questions ou des préoccupations particulières. BLG ne garantit aucunement que la teneur de cette publication est exacte, à jour ou complète. Aucune partie de cette publication ne peut être reproduite sans l'autorisation écrite de Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. Si BLG vous a envoyé cette publication et que vous ne souhaitez plus la recevoir, vous pouvez demander à faire supprimer vos coordonnées de nos listes d'envoi en communiquant avec nous par courriel à desabonnement@blg.com ou en modifiant vos préférences d'abonnement dans blg.com/fr/about-us/subscribe. Si vous pensez avoir reçu le présent message par erreur, veuillez nous écrire à communications@blg.com. Pour consulter la politique de confidentialité de BLG relativement aux publications, rendez-vous sur blg.com/fr/ProtectionDesRenseignementsPersonnels.

© 2026 Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. Borden Ladner Gervais est une société à responsabilité limitée de l'Ontario.