

Carriage creativity denied for competing class actions

12 novembre 2020

Introduction

One of the unique features of class actions is that there can be more than one proceeding in the same province, in which different plaintiffs, represented by different class counsel, seek to represent the same class of people against the same defendant(s) in respect of the same conduct.

In other contexts, parallel proceedings seeking the same relief on behalf of the same groups would be considered an abuse of process. In class actions where there are two or more overlapping proceedings, the prospective class counsel involved will usually participate in a carriage motion to determine which action will proceed and which counsel will advance the interests of the putative class.

In [Harpreet v Cronos Group Inc.](#), a plaintiff made a creative attempt to circumvent having to fight a future carriage motion by seeking a pre-emptive “exclusivity order” that would have prevented anyone else from commencing a similar putative class proceeding without leave of the court. The attempt, while certainly enterprising, did not meet with success before the Ontario Superior Court of Justice.

Background

In the context of a claim (both in common law and [under the Securities Act](#)) for misrepresentation in a public filing, the plaintiff sought what counsel described as an “exclusivity order,” which would prevent any other similar putative class actions on the same subject matter from being commenced in Ontario without leave of the court.

Defendants’ counsel raised no objections. Plaintiff’s counsel argued that granting the “exclusivity order” would further the underlying policy objectives of the class actions regime and would move the matter forward efficiently, effectively and expeditiously.

While plaintiff’s counsel was able to point to a single precedent from the Federal Court in which a similar order had been granted without a carriage motion ([Heyder v Canada \(Attorney General\)](#)), the court was not convinced. Justice Morgan described the order

granted in Heyder as more of an “inclusivity order,” given the context in which it was granted and the outcome that it furthered, which was to ensure that all claims advanced in that matter were considered in the ongoing litigation; one claim was not selected over others.

Decision

The plaintiff’s request for a unique “exclusivity order” was denied. In the face of clear guidance from the Ontario Court of Appeal in [Mancinelli v Barrick Gold Corporation](#), that “rival actions” are to be dealt with by way of a carriage motion, the plaintiff’s approach, while not improper, was “a form of end-run around a potential carriage motion.” Since there existed no rival actions at the time on which to address questions of carriage, the court determined that there was no order to be made in the circumstances.

Takeaway

It appears that, at least in Ontario, carriage motions will remain a feature of class action litigation. Fortunately, recent amendments to the [Class Proceedings Act, 1992](#), will ensure that in future cases:

- Carriage motions are decided more quickly;
- Courts will not only be able to stay competing proceedings, but bar the commencement of competing actions;
- Once 60 days have passed from the time when a carriage motion could be brought, any another plaintiff will require leave of the court to commence a similar proceeding; and
- The cost of such motions will not be borne by class members or defendants.

For more details about the legislative amendments, [please refer to BLG’s commentary.](#)

Par

[Breanna Needham](#)

Services

[Litiges, Actions collectives](#)

BLG | Vos avocats au Canada

Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. (BLG) est le plus grand cabinet d'avocats canadien véritablement multiservices. À ce titre, il offre des conseils juridiques pratiques à des clients d'ici et d'ailleurs dans plus de domaines et de secteurs que tout autre cabinet canadien. Comptant plus de 725 avocats, agents de propriété intellectuelle et autres professionnels, BLG répond aux besoins juridiques d'entreprises et d'institutions au pays comme à l'étranger pour ce qui touche les fusions et acquisitions, les marchés financiers, les différends et le financement ou encore l'enregistrement de brevets et de marques de commerce.

blg.com

Bureaux BLG

Calgary

Centennial Place, East Tower
520 3rd Avenue S.W.
Calgary, AB, Canada
T2P 0R3

T 403.232.9500
F 403.266.1395

Ottawa

World Exchange Plaza
100 Queen Street
Ottawa, ON, Canada
K1P 1J9

T 613.237.5160
F 613.230.8842

Vancouver

1200 Waterfront Centre
200 Burrard Street
Vancouver, BC, Canada
V7X 1T2

T 604.687.5744
F 604.687.1415

Montréal

1000, rue De La Gauchetière Ouest
Suite 900
Montréal, QC, Canada
H3B 5H4

T 514.954.2555
F 514.879.9015

Toronto

Bay Adelaide Centre, East Tower
22 Adelaide Street West
Toronto, ON, Canada
M5H 4E3

T 416.367.6000
F 416.367.6749

Les présents renseignements sont de nature générale et ne sauraient constituer un avis juridique, ni un énoncé complet de la législation pertinente, ni un avis sur un quelconque sujet. Personne ne devrait agir ou s'abstenir d'agir sur la foi de ceux-ci sans procéder à un examen approfondi du droit après avoir sopesé les faits d'une situation précise. Nous vous recommandons de consulter votre conseiller juridique si vous avez des questions ou des préoccupations particulières. BLG ne garantit aucunement que la teneur de cette publication est exacte, à jour ou complète. Aucune partie de cette publication ne peut être reproduite sans l'autorisation écrite de Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. Si BLG vous a envoyé cette publication et que vous ne souhaitez plus la recevoir, vous pouvez demander à faire supprimer vos coordonnées de nos listes d'envoi en communiquant avec nous par courriel à desabonnement@blg.com ou en modifiant vos préférences d'abonnement dans blg.com/fr/about-us/subscribe. Si vous pensez avoir reçu le présent message par erreur, veuillez nous écrire à communications@blg.com. Pour consulter la politique de confidentialité de BLG relativement aux publications, rendez-vous sur blg.com/fr/ProtectionDesRenseignementsPersonnels.

© 2025 Borden Ladner Gervais S.E.N.C.R.L., S.R.L. Borden Ladner Gervais est une société à responsabilité limitée de l'Ontario.